

3/09/0441/FP – Erection of Single Storey Rear Extension and First Floor Front Extension with Dormer Window at 1 Swallow Grove Farm Cottages, Mangrove Lane, Brickendon, Hertfordshire for Mr and Mrs S Saville

Date of Receipt: 25.3.09

Type: Full

Parish: BRICKENDON LIBERTY

Ward: HERTFORD HEATH

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:

1. Three Year Time Limit (IT12)
2. Matching Materials (2E13)

Directives:

1. Other Legislation (01OL)
_____ (044109FP.JS)

1.0 Background

- 1.1 Nos 1 and 2 Swallow Grove Farm Cottages comprise an attached pair of former farm workers' cottages, part of the Swallow Grove Farm group of buildings, located in open countryside about one kilometre south of Hertford.
- 1.2 The application seeks permission for a single storey rear extension and a first floor front extension with dormer window.
- 1.3 The application site is shown on the attached OS extract.
- 1.4 The site is located on the eastern side of Mangrove Lane within the Metropolitan Green Belt. The application site lies outside the main settlements and Category 1 and 2 Villages.

2.0 Site History

- 2.1 The history of the site is as follows:

3/09/0441/FP

Planning Ref:	Proposal	Decision
3/56/1240/FP	Site for pair of cottages for occupation by agricultural employees	Incomplete plans
3/57/1481/FP	Pair of houses (no agricultural tie)	Approved
3/86/1492/FP	Single storey front and side extension	Approved
3/86/1493/FP	Two storey side and single storey front extensions	Approved
3/98/0072/FP	Detached garage	Refused
3/98/0553/FP	Detached double garage	Approved

2.2 Particular attention is drawn to planning application 3/86/1493/FP where approval was given for a two storey side extension and a single storey front extension.

3.0 Consultation Responses

3.1 No consultation responses have been received.

4.0 Parish Council Representations

4.1 Brickendon Liberty Parish Council have no objections to the planning proposals.

5.0 Other Representations

5.1 The application was advertised by means of a site notice and neighbour notification letters.

5.2 No representations have been received.

6.0 Policy

6.1 The relevant East Hertfordshire Adopted Local Plan policies applicable to this application are:

- GBC1 Appropriate Development in the Green Belt
- ENV1 Design and Environmental Quality
- ENV5 Extensions to Dwellings
- ENV6 Extensions to Dwellings - Criteria

6.2 Planning Policy Guidance Note 2 'Green Belts' and Planning Policy Statement 7 'Sustainable Developments in Rural Areas' are also relevant.

7.0 Considerations

Principle

- 7.1 The site lies within the Metropolitan Green Belt where permission will not be given for inappropriate development unless very special circumstances can be demonstrated that clearly outweigh the harm by reason of inappropriateness or any other harm. Policy GBC1 advises that extensions to existing dwellings will be inappropriate within the Metropolitan Green Belt unless they can be regarded as limited extensions or alterations to existing dwellings in accordance with Policy ENV5.
- 7.2 Policy ENV5 advises that outside the main settlements and Category 1 and 2 Villages, an extension to a dwelling or the erection of outbuildings will additionally be expected to be of a scale and size that would either by itself, or cumulatively with other extensions, not disproportionately alter the size of the original dwelling nor intrude into the openness or rural qualities of the surrounding area.
- 7.3 Policy ENV6 advises that proposed extensions should be to a design and choice of materials of construction, either matching or complementary to those of the original building and its setting.
- 7.4 Also relevant in this case is Policy ENV1 where extensions are expected to be of a high standard of design and layout and to reflect local distinctiveness. Policy ENV1 also requires that development proposals should respect the amenity of occupiers of neighbouring buildings.
- 7.5 No. 1 Swallow Grove Farm Cottage has already been extended with a single storey front extension and a two storey side extension. Additionally a detached double garage was approved in 1998 under planning reference 3/98/0553/FP.
- 7.6 Calculations have been made in respect of the additions proposed to date including the current submission. It has been evident that the overall increase in floorspace as a result of past extensions and those now proposed are 90% over and above the floorspace of the original dwelling (adjusted as indicated).

3/09/0441/FP

- 7.7 The calculated increase in floor space since 1956 would not satisfy the requirements of Policies GBC1 and ENV5 which permit only limited extensions. In this case the scale and size of the current proposal when considered cumulatively with other extensions, would be considered to disproportionately alter the size of the original dwelling.
- 7.8 While the proposed development at no. 1 Swallow Grove Farm Cottages would not satisfy Policies GBC1 and ENV5 of the East Herts Local Plan, it is considered that extensions approved at the adjoining semi, no. 2 Swallow Grove Farm Cottages, should be considered as a material consideration in respect of the determination of the application at no. 1.
- 7.9 No. 2 was granted approval in 1999 (planning reference 3/99/0805/FP) for a similar single storey rear extension to that now proposed at no. 1, and, in addition, a first floor front extension and a front porch. This was followed in 2000 with approval for a two storey rear extension and a single storey side extension (planning reference 3/00/1363/FP). The 2000 approval was renewed in 2005 (planning reference 3/05/0916/FP) for a period of five years and remains extant.
- 7.10 The approval of the development proposed at no. 1 would provide a degree of symmetry to these two semi-detached dwellings. Furthermore, it is considered that the single storey rear extension and first floor front extension would not in themselves unduly intrude into the openness of the Green Belt or rural qualities of the surrounding area. Therefore, while the development proposed at no. 1 is considered to be inappropriate development within the guidelines of PPG2 and Policy GBC1 there are special circumstances in this case which justify a departure from Green Belt Policy.

Neighbour Amenity

- 7.11 It is not anticipated that the proposed development at no. 1 will have an adverse impact on the attached property at no. 1 since the proposed extension is single storey only and stands at a distance of 2.7 metres from the boundary with no. 2.

Design

- 7.12 The single storey rear extension includes a section of flat roof but notwithstanding this, it is considered, together with the first floor front extension, to be of satisfactory design, sympathetic to the semi-rural surroundings in satisfaction of policies ENV1 and ENV6 of the East Herts Local Plan.

8.0 Conclusion

- 8.1 In summary, the proposal is considered to be inappropriate development as defined by policies GBC1 and ENV5 of the East Herts Local Plan. However, the particular circumstances of the extensions to the adjoining semi-detached house and the relative lack of public view of the rear extension are considered to amount to the very special circumstances required in this case to justify a departure from policy.
- 8.2 On this basis I have recommended that planning permission be granted subject to the conditions provided at the head of this report.